

Private benefits? External benefits? Outcomes from private schooling in 21st Century Britain.

Francis Green, Jake Anders, Morag
Henderson and Golo Henseke

Background

- 20th century evidence
 - educational effects: academic/ other
- 21st century:
 - transformed service industry
 - modernisation; resource gap widening;
 - age of mass higher education
 - age of the super-rich
 - evidenced educational effects: academic, all levels

Questions

- What are the private benefits of private schooling?
 - To what extent is private schooling associated with high-status occupational attainment, with upward mobility from lower occupational classes, and with the avoidance of downward mobility from families in upper occupational classes?
 - What is the wage premium, if any?
- Are there identifiable external benefits?
 - Specifically in the form of:
 - participation in local group meetings
 - unpaid voluntary work/ unpaid help
 - charitable giving
 - social trust

Data: the Next Steps survey

- born 1989/1990 in England
- “LSYPE” Waves 1-7; school-level sampling
- picked up again in wave 8, age 25, as Next Steps
- 48% response rate by wave 8; sampling, non-response weights

- Key variables:
 - private school at age 13
 - at 25: occupational attainment; pay at 25; trust, participation, volunteering, charitable giving

	All	sd	State-educated	Privately-educated
<u>Private Benefits</u>				
Mean weekly pay (£)	412.0	404.3	401.1	557.2*
Median weekly pay (£)	384.6	-	369.5	530.5
Proportions who are:				
 In high-status occupations	0.431	0.495	0.411	0.702*
<u>External Benefits</u>				
Mean social trust⁺	6.29	2.37	6.28	6.57
Proportions who:				
 Attend local groups ⁺⁺	0.08	0.28	0.08	0.08
 Do unpaid voluntary work⁺⁺	0.17	0.38	0.17	0.19
 Fundraise/give to charity⁺⁺	0.27	0.45	0.27	0.38*

	Daughters'/sons' occupation	
Parents' occupation	Low	High
Low		
State	68.9	31.1
Private	33.5	66.5
All	68.1	31.9
High		
State	51.8	48.2
Private	32.0	68.0
All	49.3	50.7

Modelling approach

- Model 1; raw marginal effect
- Model 2: marginal effect with all socio-economic background controls:
 - parents' social class; ethnicity (9 dummies); parents' highest qualification level (6 dummies); permanent family income (average of current income over 4 waves); region (nine dummies); IDACI; home risk index (capturing potential loss of learning); behavioural risk index
- Model 3; as above plus educational attainment

'Effect' of private schooling at 13 on private benefits at age 25

	(1)	(2)	(3)
High-status occupation n=6129	0.279** (7.77)	0.120** (3.54)	0.0552+ (1.91)
Upward mobility n=3356	0.233* (2.22)	0.0945 (1.10)	0.00794 (0.12)
Downward mobility n=2773	- 0.200** (5.65)	- 0.116** (3.33)	- 0.0626+ (1.77)
Log of Weekly Pay n=4814	0.346** (6.06)	0.159** (2.83)	0.0975+ (1.84)

'Effect' of private schooling at 13 on external benefits at age 25'

	(1)	(2)	(3)
Participation n=6925	0.00567 (0.39)	-0.0101 (-0.78)	-0.0180 (-1.46)
Volunteering n=6922	0.0246 (0.80)	0.0288 (0.94)	0.0210 (0.64)
Charitable giving n=6917	0.115** (3.13)	0.0504 (1.57)	0.0327 (0.99)
Social Trust n=6931	0.294 (1.59)	-0.0384 (-0.20)	-0.0437 (-0.23)

Conclusions

- 12 ppt effect on high-status occupational attainment; also on lowering downward mobility
 - private/state earnings premium: 17 percent
 - there remains a direct pay premium; where from?
 - we detected no private school effects on external benefits
-

Implications:

- potentially still worth it
- persistent effects limiting social mobility
- schools should not claim external benefits as 'public benefit' unless they can find independent evidence

Outputs linked to the project so far:

- Green, F., J. Anders, M. Henderson and G. Henseke (2017). *Who Chooses Private Schooling in Britain and Why?* London, Centre for Research on Learning and Life Chances (LLAKES), Research Paper 62.
- Francis Green and David Kynaston (2019) *Engines of Privilege*, London, Bloomsbury; (published in February).